CATEGORY: BOILER/HEATER < 5 MMBTU

BACT Size: Small Emitter BACT (PTE < 10 lb/day)

BOILER

BACT Determination Number: 136 BACT Determination Date: 1/25/2017

Equipment Information

Permit Number: N/A -- Generic BACT Determination

Equipment Description: BOILER

Unit Size/Rating/Capacity: >= 75,000 Btu/hr and < 2.0 MMBtu/hr fired on NG

Equipment Location:

BACT Determination Information

ROCs	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
ROOS	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
NOx	Standard:	20ppm or pool/spa heaters < 400,000Btu/hr = 55ppm
	Technology Description:	Low NOx burner with good combustion practices
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
SOx	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
PM10	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
PM2.5	Standard:	Good Combustion Practices
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
СО	Standard:	400 ppm
	Technology Description:	Low NOx burner with good combustion practices
	Basis:	Achieved in Pactice
LEAD	Standard:	
	Technology Description:	
	Basis:	

Comments: All units listed ppm are ppmvd corrected to 3% O2

District Contact: Joe Carle Phone No.: (916) 874 - 4838 email: jcarle@airquality.org

Printed: 1/26/2017



BEST AVAILABLE CONTROL TECHNOLOGY DETERMINATION

DETERMINATION NO.: 136

DATE: 1/25/2017

ENGINEER: Joe Carle

Category/General Equip Description: Boiler/Heater – Natural gas

Boiler/heater greater or equal to 75,000 BTU/hr and

Equipment Specific Description: less than 2.0 MMBTU/hr, fired on natural gas

Equipment Size/Rating: Small Emitter BACT (PTE < 10 lb/day)

Previous BACT Det. No.: 112

This BACT determination will update Determination #112 for boilers/heaters greater or equal to 75,000 BTU/hr and less than 2.0 MMBtu/hr, fired on natural gas.

BACT ANALYSIS

A: ACHIEVED IN PRACTICE (Rule 202, §205.1a)

The following control technologies are currently employed as BACT for boilers/heaters greater or equal to 75,000 BTU/hr and less than 2.0 MMBTU/hr fueled by natural gas by the following air pollution control districts:

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements		
	BACT Source: EPA RACT/BACT/LAER Clearinghouse		
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr		
	VOC N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	NOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
US EPA	SOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
00 2.71	PM10 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	PM2.5 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	CO N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
	RULE REQUIREMENTS: None		

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements				
	BACT	ADD DACT Clearinghouse			
	Source: A	ARB BACT Clearinghouse			
		s with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr			
	VOC	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
ARB	SOx				
	PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range			
	RULE RE	EQUIREMENTS:			
	None				
	DAGE				
	BACT Source: 9	SMAOND RACT #112			
	Source: SMAQMD BACT #112				
		s with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr			
	voc	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not			
	NO	available.			
	NOx	Pool/spa heaters: 55 ppmvd at 3% O ₂			
	SOx	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O2 Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not			
	30%	available.			
	PM10	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not			
		available.			
	PM2.5	Good combustion practice; Use of natural gas or LPG if natural gas is not available.			
	CO	400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ , Burner technology controlling NOx as a priority			
SMAQMD	DIIIEDE	EQUIREMENTS:			
		- Water Heaters, Boilers And Process Heaters Rated Less Than 1,000,000			
	BTU Per				
	For units	with a rating of ≥ 75,000 Btu/hr to < 400,000 Btu/hr			
		Heater – 55 ppmvd of NOx corrected to 3% O ₂			
	All others	s – 20 ppmvd of NOx corrected to 3% O ₂			
	For units	with a rating of ≥ 400,000 Btu/hr to < 1 MMBtu/hr			
	20 ppmvo	d of NOx corrected to 3% O ₂			
	400 ppm	vd of CO corrected to 3% O ₂			
		- NOx from Boilers, Process Heaters and Steam Generators			
		with a rating of ≥ 1 MMBtu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr			
		d of NOx corrected to 3% O ₂			
	vd of CO corrected to 3% O ₂				

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements			
	BACT Source: SCAQMD BACT Guidelines for Non-Major Polluting Facilities Note: SCAQMD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers/heaters 2 MMBtu/hr or less, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to SCAQMD Rule 219. SCAQMD Rule 219(b)(2) Written permits are not required for boilers, process heaters, or any combustion equipment that has a rated maximum heat input capacity of 2,000,000 Btu per hour (gross) or less and are equipped to be heated exclusively with natural gas, methanol, liquefied petroleum gas, or any combination thereof.			
	VOC N/A - No NOx N/A - No SOx N/A - No PM10 N/A - No PM2.5 N/A - No	D BACT determination	ns found in the ≥ 0.0 ns found in the ≥ 0.0	75 to <2 MMBtu/hr range 75 to <2 MMBtu/hr range
South Coast AQMD	RULE REQUIREM	ENTS:		n Large Water Heaters and
	Category	NOx Limit	CO Limit	Units manufactured for use or offered for sale after
	Type 1 Unit (except pool heaters)	14 nanograms per joule of heat output (20 ppmvd @ 3% O ₂)	No standard	January 1, 2012
	Type 1 Unit (pool heater)	40 nanograms per joule of heat output (55 ppmvd NOx @3% O ₂)	No standard	January 1, 2001
	Type 2 Unit	14 nanograms per joule of heat output (20 ppmvd @ 3% O ₂)	400 ppmvd @ 3% O ₂	January 1, 2010
	INPUT CAPAC WATER HEAT (B) TYPE 2 UNIT n	ITY less than or equa ERS subject to the lin neans any water hea	al to 400,000 BTU per mits of District Rule ter, boiler or process	heater with a RATED HEAT r hour excluding TANK TYPE 1121. heater with a RATED HEAT p to and including 2,000,000

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements				
	BACT Source: NSR Requirements for BACT Note: SDCAPCD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers/heaters 5 MMBtu/hr or less, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to SDAPCD Rule 11. SDAPCD Rule 11(d) Any equipment, operation, or process that is listed below in Subsections (d)(1) through (d)(20), and that meets the stated exemption provision, parameter, requirement, or limitation, is exempt from the requirements of Rule 10. (d)(2)(v) Any boiler, process heater, or steam generator with a manufacturer's maximum gross heat input rating of less than 5 million BTU per hour fired exclusively with natural gas and/or liquefied petroleum gas.				
	For write with a ration of 75 000 Dt	/lam.taO.MMADt/lam	1		
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr VOC N/A − No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	NOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	SOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	PM10 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
San Diago	PM2.5 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
San Diego County APCD	CO N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
County 7th OD	RULE REQUIREMENTS: Regulation 4, Rule 69.2.1 – Small Boilers, Process Heaters, and Steam Generators				
	Emission Limits (Effective on or after March 25, 2010)				
	Type of equipment and size, in	NOx	СО		
	MMBtu/hr	ppmvd	ppmvd		
	Units ≥ 0.6 and ≤ 2.0, except as below, fired on gaseous fuel	30	400		
	Units ≥ 0.6 and ≤ 2.0, except as below, fired on liquid fuel	40	400		
	Units < 0.6	Rule not applicable	Rule not applicable		
	(A) This rule does not apply to wast (B) This rule does not apply to Furnamaterial being heated is in direct (C) This rule does not apply to the equipment.	aces, kilns, and any comb et contact with the produc	ts of combustion.		

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements				
	BACT Source: BAAQMD BACT Guideline Note: BAAQMD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers/heaters 10 MMBtu/hr or less fired exclusively on natural gas or LPG, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to BAAQMD Regulation 2, Rule 1.				
	BAAQMD Rule 2-1-114 The following equipment is exempt from the, requirements of Sections 2-1-301 and 302 (requirement to obtain an ATC or PTO): (114.1) Boilers, Heaters, Steam Generators, Duct Burners, and Similar Combustion Equipment: 1.2 Any of the above equipment with less than 10 million BTU per hour rated heat input if fired exclusively with natural gas (including compressed natural gas), liquefied petroleum gas (e.g. propane, butane, isobutane, propylene, butylenes, and their mixtures), or any combination thereof.				
	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr				
	VOCN/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr rangeNOxN/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	SOx N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.073 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
Bay Area	PM10 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
AQMD	PM2.5 N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	CO N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range				
	RULE REQUIREMENTS: BAAQMD Reg 9, Rule 6 – Nitrogen Oxide Emissions from Natural Gas-fired Boilers and Water Heaters				
	Emission Limits (Effective January 1, 2013)				
	Type of unit	Size of Unit in Btu/hr	NOx Limit in nanograms per joule of heat output (ppmvd @ 3% O2)		
	Pool/spa heater	75,001 to 400,000	No standard		
	Pool/spa heater	400,001 to 2,000,000	14 (20)		
	Other boilers/heaters	75,001 to 2,000,000	14 (20)		

District/Agency	Best Available Control Technology (BACT)/Requirements
	BACT Source: SJVUAPCD BACT Guideline Note: SJVUAPCD BACT Guidelines do not contain a determination for boilers 5 MMBtu/hr or less, since these units are not required to obtain a written permit, pursuant to SJUVAPCD Rule 2020.

SJVUAPCD Rule 2020 §6.0

No Authority to Construct or Permit to Operate shall be required for (§6.1) steam generators, steam superheaters, water boilers, water heaters, steam cleaners, and closed indirect heat transfer systems that have a maximum input heat rating of 5,000,000 Btu per hour (gross) or less and is equipped to be fired exclusively with (§6.1.1.1) natural gas, (§6.1.1.2) liquefied petroleum gas, or (§6.1.1.3) any combination of the two.

For units	For units with a rating of 75,000 Btu/hr to < 2 MMBtu/hr		
VOC	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
NOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
SOx	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
PM10	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
PM2.5	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		
СО	N/A – No BACT determinations found in the ≥ 0.075 to <2 MMBtu/hr range		

RULE REQUIREMENTS:

San Joaquin Valley APCD SJVUAPCD Rule 4308 – Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters – 0.075 MMBtu/hr to less than 2.0 MMBtu/hr

Emission Limits (Effective on or after January 1, 2015)			
	NOx Limit (corrected to 3% O2)		
Type and Size of Unit, in MMBtu/hr	PUC Gas	Non-PUC Gas or Liquid	
	lb/MMBtu of heat input (ppmvd)	lb/MMBtu of heat input (ppmvd)	
Units ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4, except as below	0.024 (20)	0.093 (77)	
Units > 0.4 and < 2.0, except as below	0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	
Instantaneous water heaters ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4	0.024 (20)	0.093 (77)	
Instantaneous water heaters >0.4 and <2.0	0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	
Pool heaters ≥ 0.075 and ≤ 0.4	0.068 (55)	0.093 (77)	
Pool heaters > 0.4 and < 2.0	0.024 (20)	0.036 (30)	

For units with a rating of \geq 0.4 MMBtu/hr and < 2.0 MMBtu/hr: 400 ppmvd of CO corrected to 3% O_2

The following control technologies have been identified and are ranked based on stringency:

	SUMMARY OF ACHIEVED IN PRACTICE CONTROL TECHNOLOGIES
VOC	1.Good combustion practices [SMAQMD (BACT)]
	2.No standard [SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]
NOx	1. Pool/spa heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 55 ppmvd at 3% O ₂
	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ - [SMAQMD, SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD]
	2. Pool/spa heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: no standard
	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ - [BAAQMD]
	3. Boilers/heaters < 600,000 Btu/hr: no standard
	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SDCAPCD]
SOx	1. Good combustion practices [SMAQMD (BACT)]
	2.No standard [SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]
PM10	1. Good combustion practices [SMAQMD (BACT)]
	2.No standard [SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]
PM2.5	1. Good combustion practices [SMAQMD (BACT)]
	2.No standard [SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD, SDCAPCD, BAAQMD]
СО	1.400 ppmvd at 3% - [SMAQMD (BACT)]
	2.Boilers/heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: no standard
	All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SCAQMD, SJVUAPCD]
	3.Boilers/heaters < 600,000 Btu/hr: no standard
	All other boilers/heaters: 400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂ – [SDCAPCD]
	4.No standard – [BAAQMD]

The following control technologies have been identified as the most stringent, achieved in practice control technologies:

BEST CONTROL TECHNOLOGIES ACHIEVED			
Pollutant	Standard	Source	
VOC	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)	
	Pool/spa heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 55 ppmvd at	SMAQMD (Rule 414),	
NOx	3% O ₂	SDCAPCD (Rule 4308),	
	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SCAQMD (Rule 1146.2)	
SOx	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)	
PM10	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)	
PM2.5	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)	
CO	400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SMAQMD (current BACT)	

B. TECHNOLOGICALLY FEASIBLE AND COST EFFECTIVE (Rule 202, §205.1.b.):

Technologically Feasible Alternatives:

Any alternative basic equipment, fuel, process, emission control device or technique, singly or in combination, determined to be technologically feasible by the Air Pollution Control Officer.

The table below shows the technologically feasible alternatives identified as capable of reducing emissions beyond the levels determined to be "Achieved in Practice" as per Rule 202, §205.1.a.

VOC	No other technologically feasible option identified
NOx	Selective Catalytic Reduction (SCR)
	2. Flue Gas Recirculation (FGR) with a Low-NOx burner
SOx	No other technologically feasible option identified
PM10	No other technologically feasible option identified
PM2.5	No other technologically feasible option identified
CO	No other technologically feasible option identified

Cost Effective Determination

After identifying the technologically feasible control options, a cost analysis is performed to take into consideration economic impacts for all technologically feasible controls identified.

Maximum Cost per Ton of Air Pollutants Controlled

A control technology is considered to be cost-effective if the cost of controlling one ton of that air pollutant is less than the limits specified below (except coating operations):

<u>Pollutant</u>	Maximum Cost (\$/ton)
ROG	17,500
NO_X	24,500
PM ₁₀	11,400
SO_X	18,300
CO	TBD if BACT triggered

SCR:

Typically selective catalytic reduction (SCR) can be used to reduce emissions from larger boilers. SCR requires ammonia or urea for NOx reduction and units of this size range are typically used in residences and service/commercial applications where storage of these materials is impractical and could pose a health risk. Additionally, SCR is designed for industrial units that run full time and can maintain a temperature that the catalyst requires for NOx reduction, whereas smaller units are turned on and off throughout the day and cannot maintain the required temperatures. Finally, SCR systems require frequent maintenance for operation which may not be practical in a residential or small service/commercial setting.

District Staff has done an analysis¹ for using SCR on a boiler rated at 20 MMBTU/hr and the cost effectiveness was \$53,084 per ton of NOx reduced. As the rating of the unit goes down the total emission reduction will decrease while cost will stay relatively equivalent and therefore the cost effectiveness will increase. Therefore, SCR is not only technologically infeasible for this size range of boilers/heaters but it is also not cost effective and is eliminated as a control option.

FGR with a Low-NOx Burner:

Adding FGR to a smaller unit would result in minimal additional reductions when paired with a low-NOx burner, and would cost more than a low-NOx burner alone. Like SCR, the system requires frequent maintenance for operation which may not be practical in a residential or small service/commercial setting. The BAAQMD did an analysis of adding FGR to a boiler in the 400,000 to 2,000,000 Btu/hr range in their 2007 Staff Report for Regulation 9, Rule 6 and found that the

¹ SMAQMD, "BACT Determination: Boilers/Heaters ≥5 and <20 MMBTU/hr fired on natural gas or LPG," June 3,2015

BACT Determination Boilers/Heaters ≥75,000 BTU/hr and <2.0 MMBTU/hr fired on natural gas January 25, 2017 Page 9 of 9

incremental cost effectiveness of adding FGR over a low-NOx burner is estimated at \$60,000 per ton of NOx reduced. Therefore, FGR added to a boiler/heater with a low-NOx burner is not cost effective and is eliminated as a control option.

C. SELECTION OF BACT:

Because no other technically feasible alternatives are available for the size range of these boilers/heaters BACT for VOC, SOx, PM10, PM2.5 and CO will remain at what is currently achieved in practice. Currently what is in SMAQMD Rule 412 and other district rules are more stringent than the current BACT standard by limiting the size range of pool/spa heaters that can fall under the 55 ppmvd emission limit.

BACT for Boilers/Heaters ≥ 75,000 Btu/hr and < 2.0 MMBtu/hr Fired on Natural Gas		
Pollutant	Standard	Source
VOC	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)
	Pool/spa heaters < 400,000 Btu/hr: 55 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SMAQMD (Rule 414),
	All other boilers/heaters: 20 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SDCAPCD (Rule 4308),
	All other bollers/fleaters. 20 ppinva at 3 % O ₂	SCAQMD (Rule 1146.2)
SOx	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)
PM10	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)
PM2.5	Good combustion practices	SMAQMD (current BACT)
CO	400 ppmvd at 3% O ₂	SMAQMD (current BACT)

D. SELECTION OF T-BACT:

Toxics are in the form of VOCs and particulate matter. Since toxic emission from natural gas fired boilers in the 2 MMBtu/hr or less size range are so small and the cancer risk is not expected to be anywhere close to 1 in a million cases, T-BACT was not evaluated for this determination.

REVIEWED BY:	DATE:
APPROVED BY:	DATE: